

**SAN ANTONIO HISTORIC AND DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION
OFFICIAL MINUTES
AUGUST 21, 2013**

- The Historic and Design Review Commission of the City of San Antonio met in session at 3:00 P.M., in the Board Room, Development and Business Services Center, 1901 S. Alamo
- The meeting was called to order by Commissioner Cone, Chair, and the roll was called by the Secretary.

PRESENT: Cone, Laffoon, Guarino, Valenzuela, Feldman, Connor

ABSENT: Judson, Zuniga, Salas, Shafer

- Chairman's Statement
- Citizens to be heard
- Announcements

The Commission then considered the Consent Agenda which consisted of:

- | | |
|-----------------------|--------------------|
| 1. Case No. 2013-251 | 1120 E. Crockett |
| 2. Case No. 2013-250 | 3903 N. St. Mary's |
| 3. Case No. 2013-255 | 210 W. Market |
| 4. Case No. 2013-266 | 803 River Road |
| 5. Case No. 2013-259 | 1005 Nolan St. |
| 6. Case No. 2013-258 | 233 Claudia |
| 7. Case No. 2013-256 | 2720 McCullough |
| 8. Case No. 2013-190 | 109 W. French Pl. |
| 9. Case No. 2013-262 | 221 W. Mistletoe |
| 10. Case No. 2013-257 | 727 S. Alamo |
| 11. Case No. 2013-263 | 424 Lamar |
| 12. Case No. 2013-252 | 612 Leigh St. |

Items 6 and 7 were pulled from the Consent Agenda to be heard under Individual Consideration.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Guarino and seconded by Commissioner Valenzuela to approve the remaining cases on the Consent Agenda based staff recommendations.

AYES: Cone, Laffoon, Guarino, Valenzuela, Feldman, Connor

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

6. HDRC NO. 2013-258

Applicant: Grace Co.

Address: 233 Claudia

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

Install a front yard fence at 233 Claudia. The proposed fence will consist of two different fence types. Along the west side of the front yard, the applicant proposes to install a 3' tall wood privacy style fence. Along the front (south) side of the front yard, the applicant proposes to install a 4' tall wood post and wire fence.

FINDINGS:

- a. The existing house at 233 Claudia first appears on the 1912 Sanborn map. At that time, the home was addressed at 129 Claudia St. Since then, the streets surrounding Claudia St. have been realigned, leaving the rear of the property at 233 Claudia to face Cedar St.
- b. The proposed wood post and wire type fence is appropriate in terms of style, materials, height and location for the King William Historic District. It is consistent with the Historic Design Guidelines for Site Elements, Section 2.B.i, 2.B.ii, 2.B.iii, and 2.B.v.
- c. The proposed 3' privacy fence along the west side of the yard is not appropriate for placement in a front yard, as outlined in the Historic Design Guidelines for Site Elements, Section 2.C.ii.

Staff recommends approval with the stipulation that the entire front yard fence be composed of wood post and wire, rather than incorporating a segment of privacy fencing based on these findings.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Guarino and seconded by Commissioner Laffoon to approve with stipulation that the entire front yard fence be composed of wood post and wire, rather than incorporating a segment of privacy fencing based on findings a through c.

AYES: Cone, Laffoon, Guarino, Valenzuela, Feldman, Connor

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

7. HDRC NO. 2013-256

Applicant: Chad Carey

Address: 2720 McCullough

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to permanently display one (1) aluminum, wall-mounted sign measuring 7 feet wide and 2.2 feet tall for a total square footage of 15.4 sf. The sign will be mounted to the wall space above the entrance and anchored to the mortar joints in between bricks.

This sign was given administratively approval for a temporary display of 30 days. The current request for a Certificate of Appropriateness is to keep the sign permanently at its present location.

FINDINGS:

- a. The proposed sign is consistent with the Guidelines for Signage in terms of number, size, scale, materials, color and typeface.
- b. The wall space on which the proposed sign is mounted features a brickwork arch motif. The permanent display of the proposed sign would obscure views to this portion of architectural detail which is inconsistent with the Guidelines for Signage 6.C.i and 6.C.ii. However, the proposed sign is well-proportioned for the area it is fixed to and can be removed without damaging the façade. The brick pattern is continued elsewhere on the building, so the placement of the sign as proposed would not completely conceal architectural details at this location. The decorative medallion, which is the main focal point of the façade, will remain visible.

Staff recommends approval as submitted based on findings a and b.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Guarino and seconded by Commissioner Connor to approve as submitted based on findings a and b.

AYES: Cone, Laffoon, Guarino, Valenzuela, Feldman, Connor

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

13. HDRC NO. 2013-204

Applicant: Sameer Paya

Address: 325 Lavaca

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to construct a two-story, single family residence on the vacant lot at 325 Lavaca. The house will have a single-sloped roof and a building footprint of approximately 600 sf. Proposed materials consist of vertical board and batten wood siding, horizontal wood siding, a standing seam metal roof, wood columns and metal-clad wood windows (both fixed and casement). A 6-foot cedar privacy fence is proposed for the side and rear property lines, not to extend past the front plane of the house. A 9-foot decomposed granite driveway is proposed along the eastern property line.

FINDINGS:

- a. This application was reviewed by the Design Review Committee on July 9, 2013. At that meeting, the applicant presented updated drawings that illustrated increased setbacks from the side and front property lines. Overall, the Committee was in favor of the design and made no recommendations for improvement. Staff expressed concern over the lack of fenestration in the west elevation. The applicant noted that window with western exposure were not desired, and that due to the presence of a vacant lot immediately to the west of this property, there was uncertainty about the proximity of future construction.
- b. The design of the proposed new construction references an existing, two-story neighboring structure at 321 Lavaca. The proposal is consistent with the Guidelines for new construction in terms of setbacks, façade orientation, entrances, scale, mass, building to lot ratio, materials and architectural details.
- c. The single slope roof is a departure from historic precedents in the neighborhood, but is a similar height to the front-gabled structure located immediately to the east.
- d. As submitted, the west façade features a predominately blank wall. The Guidelines for New Construction C.ii requires that no new façade exceed 40 feet without being penetrated by windows. Although the proposal technically meets this guideline, staff finds that additional window openings incorporated on the west façade would be more appropriate for a structure of this size and more consistent with nearby historic properties in the district.

Staff recommends approval with the stipulation that additional fenestrations or architectural details are added to the west façade in order to break up the predominantly blank wall.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Connor and seconded by Commissioner Guarino to approve as submitted.

AYES: Cone, Laffoon, Guarino, Valenzuela, Feldman, Connor

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

14. HDRC NO. 2013-264

Applicant: Benjamin Grant Taylor

Address: 1005 Hays St.

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

1. Install a new wrought iron front yard fence. The proposed fence will be composed of simple pickets and will be 4' tall.
2. Install a 10' wide decomposed granite driveway on the east side of the property. The proposed driveway will connect to an existing curb cut in front of the home.

FINDINGS:

- a. The existing house at 1005 Nolan first appears on the 1912 Sanborn map.
 - b. In the Dignowity Hill Historic District survey, the home at 1005 Nolan was identified as a contributing resource.
 - c. The proposed wrought iron fence is appropriate in terms of style, materials, height and location for the Dignowity Hill Historic District. It is consistent with the Historic Design Guidelines for Site Elements, Section 2.B.i, 2.B.ii, 2.B.iii, and 2.B.v.
 - d. The proposed new driveway will not require a new curb cut and will connect to an existing concrete apron, consistent with the Historic Design Guidelines for Site Elements, Section 5.B.ii.
 - e. The width and the use of a pervious material for the proposed driveway is appropriate and will increase stormwater infiltration, consistent with the Historic Design Guidelines for Site Elements, Section 5.B.i.
 - f. The location of the proposed driveway is constrained due to the proximity of the existing home to the east and west property lines. While parking in the front yard area is not typically appropriate for a historic site, staff finds that in this case, the site conditions limit where a driveway can be placed. Similarly, the proposed driveway will be to the side of the home and will not significantly impact direct views of the house from the street.
1. Staff recommends approval as submitted based on finding c.
 2. Staff recommends approval as submitted based on findings d-f.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Guarino and seconded by Commissioner Feldman to approve as submitted based on findings a through f.

AYES: Cone, Laffoon, Guarino, Valenzuela, Feldman, Connor

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

15. HDRC NO. 2013-260

Applicant: Frank Z. Ruttenberg

Address: 1311 S. Alamo

Withdrawn per the applicant's request.

16. HDRC NO. 2012-261

Applicant: Luis Pescador

Address: 202 Mary Louise

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to replace the front door and screen door.

FINDINGS:

- a. The front door and screen door at 202 Mary Louise were replaced without appropriate approvals or permits.
- b. According to City Directories, the house at 202 Mary Louise located within the Monticello Park Historic District was built between 1925-1927 in the Spanish Eclectic style. The original door consisted of a solid wood door with a small porthole window, set behind a decorative screen door.
- c. According to the Guidelines for Exterior Maintenance and Alterations, historic doors should be preserved. When deteriorated beyond repair, doors should be replaced in kind to match existing. If an in-kind replacement is not feasible, features must match the size, material and profile of the historic element.
- d. The style of the proposed door is not compatible with the Spanish Eclectic style of the home. The proposed door is more appropriate for a suburban house or new construction and detracts from the overall character of the property. The proposed replacement door does not match the material and profile of the historic door.

Staff does not recommend approval as submitted based on the findings above. Staff recommends that a door that is compatible with the architectural style, material and profile of the historic door is used.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Valenzuela and seconded by Commissioner Connor to approve of newly proposed door submitted August 21, 2013.

AYES: Cone, Laffoon, Guarino, Valenzuela, Feldman, Connor

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

17. HDRC NO. 2013-254

Applicant: Daniel and Mary Hansen

Address: 329 E. Myrtle

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to install a ridge cap vent on a previously approved metal roof of a new workshop/carport.

FINDINGS:

- a. The construction of a new workshop/carport received HDRC approval on June 19, 2013, with the stipulation that the roof not incorporate a ridge cap vent and use a double munch seam instead.
- b. Attics were historically vented through gable vents. Ridge vents are predominantly exhaust devices that are commonly used on modern roofs. Consistent with the Guidelines for New Construction, new metal roofs should be installed in a similar fashion as historic metal roofs. The specification checklist for metal roofs includes using a crimped ridge seam consistent with the historic application or a low-profile ridge cap with no ridge cap vent or end cap if a crimped ridge is not used.

c. The main house's roof has a ridge cap vent. The roof installation on the main house received HDRC approval on October 7, 2009. At that time, no stipulations regarding roof detailing were included as part of the approval.

Staff does not recommend approval as submitted based on the findings above. Staff recommends that no ridge cap vent is installed and that other methods of venting the workshop are explored.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Connor and seconded by Commissioner Valenzuela to approve as submitted.

AYES: Cone, Laffoon, Valenzuela, Feldman, Connor

NAYS: Guarino

THE MOTION CARRIED.

18. HDRC NO. 2013-253

Applicant: ADA Inc.

Address: 654 Leigh St.

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to construct a 2-story, single family residence on a vacant lot at 654 Leigh St. The lot is located on a cul-de-sac, and has an existing concrete approach and driveway. The proposed new construction has a footprint of approximately 1,029 sf and a total square footage of approximately 1,958 sf. The design features a single-slope standing seam metal roof with false-front parapet wall, a stucco exterior, a two-story covered porch over the entry with attached spiral staircase, large picture windows, horizontal sliding windows and an inset second-floor balcony. The existing driveway will be expanded with new concrete in order to accommodate parking for three vehicles in the front yard. Existing significant pecan trees flanking the existing driveway would be removed for the new construction.

FINDINGS:

- a. The proposed building footprint takes up the majority of the existing lot, and appears to exceed the 50% building to lot ratio referenced in the Guidelines for New Construction 2.D.i. Given the small size of the lot, an exception to this guideline may be warranted. However, as proposed, the existing driveway in the front of the property is also being expanded with additional impervious cover. The addition of new impervious cover should be limited in order to be compliant with the Historic Design Guidelines.
- b. As submitted, the proposed concrete driveway expands upon the existing concrete apron and driveway. The existing width of the apron must be maintained for compliance with the Guidelines for Site Elements 5.B.ii. Removing the front yard for a three-car parking pad would not be appropriate.
- c. Many existing lots on this block of Leigh Street are vacant. A large vacant area to the north of this property will be developed by the San Antonio Housing Authority in the future. Intact nearby properties feature small, one-story houses with craftsman and folk Victorian influences. The adjacent lot immediately to the west features a one-story minimal traditional house with some alterations. A major highway runs immediately adjacent to the east.
- d. As submitted, the proposed front yard setback and building orientation are consistent with nearby historic properties. This conforms to the Guidelines for New Construction 1.A.
- e. No historic properties on this block of Leigh Street are more than 1 story tall, although there are nearby examples of taller new construction. A new building that is only a single story would be the most consistent with the Guidelines for New Construction 2.A.i. Generally, if a two-story building is desired, the overall profile should be reduced in order to be more compatible with nearby historic properties.

f. As submitted, the proposed new construction features a single slope roof, but due to a false-front parapet wall on the north (front) façade, will have the appearance of a flat roof. This is a departure from existing conditions found in nearby historic properties and is not consistent with the Guidelines for New Construction 2.B.i.

g. As submitted, the proposed new construction features windows in a variety of sizes and configurations. New construction should feature a fenestration pattern that is in consistent with those found in nearby historic properties in order to conform to the Guidelines for New Construction 2.C.i. The proposed windows should feature traditional window sizes and configurations in order to conform with this guideline.

h. The proposed materials of stucco and standing seam represent materials commonly found in the Lavaca Historic District and are consistent with the Guidelines for New Construction 3.A.i. However, the proposed metal spiral staircase at the front entry introduces an element for which there is no precedent, and should be addressed in future revisions to the design.

i. The plans submitted do not identify trees affected by the proposed new construction. Because there are several large trees on the property, the potential impact on those trees should be considered by the HDRC. If new construction is approved by the HDRC, any tree removal will require permits from the City Arborist. Ordinance-protected trees will require mitigation. The HDRC may require additional mitigation or prohibit certain trees from being removed or negatively impacted by impervious cover.

Staff does not recommend approval based on findings a through i.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Guarino and seconded by Commissioner Connor to refer to the DRC.

AYES: Cone, Laffoon, Guarino, Valenzuela, Feldman, Connor

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

- Executive Session: Consultation on attorney – client matters (real estate, litigation, contracts, personnel, and security matters) as well as the above mentioned agenda items may be discussed under Chapter 551 of the Texas Government Code.
- Adjournment.

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 5:00 P.M.

APPROVED



Tim Cone
Chair